



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

short, consequently ambitious students will have to consult other grammars for further information.

HENRY E. HAXO

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH DAKOTA

---

*Sources of the Religious Element in Flaubert's "Salammbô."* By ARTHUR HAMILTON. *Elliott Monographs No. 4.* Baltimore: John Hopkins Press, 1917. Pp. xi+123.

This is the fourth of a group of studies of Flaubert begun at Johns Hopkins University under the direction of Professor Adolphe Terracher (now of Liverpool) during his stay in America. The first to appear had to do with the *Œuvres de jeunesse*, the third with the composition of *Salammbô* traced through the author's letters, the second, like the one before us, with the sources and structure of the novel. Dr. Fay studied with great care the debt of Flaubert to Polybius' history of the revolt of the mercenaries (*Elliott Monographs No. 2*), and Dr. Hamilton has diligently sought the sources for the religious element, important both in the structure of the tale and in the general setting of its scenes. No product of Flaubert's pen betrays more clearly than the religious passages in *Salammbô* the romanticist seeing through the realist's eye. The descriptions of the temples of Tanit and of Moloch, for example, are built up objectively, realistically, but only a romantic fancy would have dwelt on those details of their mysteries that Flaubert chose to throw into relief. It is not surprising that the archaeologist Froehner should have been reminded of *Hernani* when reading the account of the council meeting in the temple of Baal (*Revue contemporaine* [1862], p. 853).

Flaubert's letters from 1857 to 1862 contain many references to the authorities he was using to reconstruct Carthaginian civilization; Abrami's notes to the Conard edition of *Salammbô* reproduce much information from the author's papers; and Flaubert's letters to Sainte-Beuve and to Froehner, written in response to their criticisms of the historical element in the book, give numerous details about his sources. These works served Dr. Hamilton as his point of departure, and as a result of his investigations we now have access to the texts of the passages from which Flaubert drew almost all the facts, or pseudo-facts, for the religious element of the novel.

It is interesting to learn where the novelist found his material. His chief source was Creuzer, *Les Religions de l'antiquité*, a translation of a four-volume German work; next in importance were the *Recherches sur la topographie de Carthage*, by Dureau de la Malle; then comes a long list containing, among others, Pliny's *Natural History*, various *Mémoires* of the Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres, Heeren's *De la Politique et du commerce des peuples de l'antiquité*, Polybius, Plutarch, Diodorus, Lucian, Silius Italicus, Herodotus, Vitruvius, and Cahen's translation of the Bible. It is easy to understand Flaubert's plaints in letters of the period: "J'accumule notes sur notes, livres sur livres. . . . Je bâche comme un nègre. . . . J'ai bien

avalé depuis le 1er février une cinquantaine de volumes" . . . (*Correspondance*, III, 144, 146, 240). His aim he expressed thus: "Quant à l'archéologie, elle sera 'probable.' Voilà tout. Pourvu que l'on ne puisse me *prouver* que j'ai dit des absurdités, c'est tout ce que je demande" (p. 151). How seriously to heart he took this element of his novel is indicated by his vigorous defense of its accuracy in his replies to Sainte-Beuve and to Froehner, while admitting frankly the book's shortcomings; yet his prime motive was of course artistic and literary. In 1857 he had written: "Je donnerais la demi-rame de notes que j'ai écrites depuis cinq mois et les quatre vingt dix-huit volumes que j'ai lus pour être pendant trois secondes seulement réellement ému par la passion de mes héros" (p. 151), and after the five-year long effort he exclaimed to Sainte-Beuve: "Je crois avoir fait quelque chose qui ressemble à Carthage. Mais ce n'est pas la question. Je me moque de l'archéologie! Si la couleur n'est pas une, si les détails détonnent, si les mœurs ne dérivent pas de la religion et les faits des passions . . . , s'il n'y a pas, en un mot, harmonie, je suis dans le faux. . . . Tout se tient" (p. 343).

In his Introduction, Dr. Hamilton points out that the story revolves about the struggle between Tanit and Moloch for supremacy in Carthage, and that the religious element is consequently as much a part of the structure of the book as is the historical basis drawn from Polybius. Salammbô and Matho suggest in some sort to each other the two divinities, the moon and the sun. Salammbô sins involuntarily against Tanit. In her effort to save the sacred veil for Carthage she seals her own doom (p. 414), and Moloch destroys Matho and the Barbarians for taking arms against the city consecrated to his worship. In fact Dr. Hamilton might have indicated more explicitly that what endures from all this welter of destruction is the race, the city protected by the two divine principles, and that the individuals caught in the cross-currents of the influences that threaten the existence of the favored people cannot do other than perish miserably. This harmonizes with the general determinism to be found elsewhere in Flaubert.

One example of the results of Dr. Hamilton's study of a particular problem is all that can be given here. The letter to Sainte-Beuve names six sources for the description of the temple of Tanit (*Salammbô*, chap. v): Lucian, *De la Déesse syrienne*; the temples at Jerusalem, Gozzo, Thugga; St. Jerome; and the medallions of the duke of Luynes. The debt to the first three is undoubted, but the coins in question were not placed on exhibition until 1862, and it was the reproductions in Creuzer and Lajard that actually gave the details. Flaubert used, further, Pliny, Philostratus, Pausanias, Quatremère (in the *Mémoires de l'Académie des Inscriptions*), Lucian's *Amours*, Renan, Dureau de la Malle, Dufour (*Histoire de la prostitution*), Abbé Mignot, Strabo, and the *De Diis Syris* of Selden. This very enumeration is a tribute to Dr. Hamilton's industry. It was manifestly no small task to run down all the right passages. One is even more amazed at Flaubert's patient industry, at his astonishing fidelity to his theory that the facts must

tell their own story, at his supreme artistry that fused such a variety of material into this really wonderful chapter. There can be few better examples of a romantic imagination working with as solid material as could be gathered by the most realistic method, and it is interesting to observe again and again how the artist is nearly always more concise than his sources, and how often he raises them to the level of imaginative literature by the addition of an image or by throwing into relief a concrete and picturesque detail.

Dr. Hamilton has been successful in finding the sources of nearly all the passages bearing on the religious element. Perhaps the longest that remains to be studied is that describing the funeral rites of the barbarians (pp. 279-81). The reader's curiosity is also piqued by several briefer passages, as, for instance, the oath of Narr'Havas (p. 113), and the striking mystic sentence in the description of Hamilcar's prayer: "Il s'efforçait à bannir de sa pensée toutes les formes, tous les symboles et les appellations des dieux, afin de mieux saisir l'esprit immuable que les apparences dérobaient" (p. 142).

The final chapter discusses Flaubert's utilization of his sources. Dr. Hamilton observes that, from chapter vii on, the novelist introduces historic detail in such abundance as to make it the *raison d'être* of the latter part of the book rather than the fortunes of his personages, and he ascribes this situation largely to the fact that the author's sources at this stage no longer contained elements that fired his imagination. The reason almost certainly lies deeper; it is suggested in Flaubert's own uneasiness about the psychology of his characters, an uneasiness that is not surprising when a writer with a realistic method and conscience attempts to revive souls that loved and died in vanished Carthage. No amount of documentation could recreate Punic psychology, and more than one passage in Flaubert's letters indicates that he realized this.

Dr. Hamilton concludes that Flaubert was less a novelist than a master of descriptions, that he was at his best when his imagination was stimulated by the sources on which he drew for facts, and that since *Salammbô* reflects the author's personality, it is, by Flaubert's own standards, a failure. Would it not be truer to say that the weakness of *Salammbô* as a novel is partly inherent in historical fiction, and partly arises from the author's very attempt at being impersonal? Had he put himself more freely into his book he would have depicted at least one human being, even at the cost of committing an anachronism; but as he was unable to resurrect souls so thoroughly dead and was rigid in the exclusion of the living present, his personages remain in a sort of limbo, caught in the veil that lies thick between us and long-destroyed Carthage.

Such a study as this will hardly lead to a revaluation of *Salammbô* as a novel, but Flaubert the artist, the poet, the master-craftsman, comes out all the greater. The reader is constantly amazed and delighted at his ability to transmute the baser metals into his own fine gold.

There is an unpleasantly large number of typographical errors in this volume, due probably to printing conditions in France in war time, and the style is occasionally awkward and always neutral. The reader is perhaps even a little shocked to find the phrase "clear, interesting descriptions" applied to the colorful and highly poetic pages of the fifth chapter of *Salammbô*.

A. COLEMAN

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO